CCRPC Long Range Planning Committee

AGENDA

DATE: Wednesday, October 14, 2015
TIME: 4:00 p.m. to 6:00 pm
PLACE: CCRPC Office, 110 West Canal Street, Suite 202, Winooski, VT.

1. Welcome and Introductions – 5 minutes

2. The Task Ahead and ECOS Plan Organization 101 – 10 minutes

3. ECOS Plan Amendments – 100 minutes (25 minutes per topic)
   a. Earth Extraction*
   b. Utilities and Facilities*
   c. Child Care*
   d. Growth Relative to Adjacent Regions - Tentative

4. Next Meetings – 5 minutes
   Wednesday, December 9, 2015 from 4 to 6 pm
   Tuesday, January 12, 2016 from 4pm to 6pm
   Wednesday, April 13, 2016 from 4pm to 6pm

5. Adjourn

*=attached to agenda in the meeting packet

In accordance with provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990, the CCRPC will ensure public meeting sites are accessible to all people. Requests for free interpretive or translation services, assistive devices, or other requested accommodations, should be made to Emma Long, CCRPC Title VI Coordinator, at 802-846-4490 ext *21 or elong@ccrpcvt.org, no later than 3 business days prior to the meeting for which services are requested.
Earth Resource Extraction Deficiency

Proposed Amendments to 2.4.3 Working Lands & Land Based Industries:

Chittenden County contains two major zones of bedrock geology: Sedimentary Zone – Rocks formed by the deposit of sediment, located predominantly in the lowlands between Lake Champlain and the uplands on the eastern side of the County; and Metamorphosed Zone – Rocks formed by metamorphic processes located predominantly in the uplands on the eastern side of the County. No major geologic threats (such as major active fault lines, seismic disturbances, areas prone to sinkholes or subsidence) or opportunities (such as major deposits of valuable minerals) exist in the County. The only earth resources in Chittenden County that currently are commercially viable are sand and gravel. Extraction industries are associated with different land management issues than farms and forests; these are included here for lack of a better location at this time. These nonrenewable resources are used to produce building materials (such as concrete and railroad ballast), to use as landscaping materials, and to maintain roads. The earth resources in Chittenden County that currently are commercially viable are sand (over two billion cubic yards available) and gravel (430 million cubic yards available). Chittenden County contained 3 primary producing construction sand and gravel areas, and a total of 10 producing mines within those areas (Vermont Geological Survey/U.S. Geological Survey and USGS Mineral Resource Data System). While these resources are limited, they play an important role in our land development practices and economy and it is important to manage them carefully.

Proposed Addition to Strategy 3.2.4: Increase investment in and decrease subdivision of working lands and significant habitats, and support local food systems:

3. Earth Resources Extraction—Mineral extraction and processing facilities should be planned, constructed, and managed, in conjunction with State and local regulations, to:

a. Not place an excessive or uneconomic burden on local and state highways and bridges – including but not limited to a burden to the function and safety of existing roads and bridges serving the project site, strain from heavy loads on roadbeds and bridges, conflicts with pedestrians or bicyclists and increased heavy traffic in dense residential areas; and

b. Minimize any adverse affects on water quality, fish and wildlife habitats, and adjacent land uses; and

c. Plan for their eventual rehabilitation so that slopes are stable and the surface is revegetated. To that end, topsoil should not be removed from sites and excavations should stop early enough so that stable slopes can be established on the property; and

d. Extraction sites should be screened to the extent practical if topography and vegetation allow.
Utility & Facilities Deficiencies

Proposed Amendments to 2.3.1 Education, Knowledge and Skills:

School Facilities: identified as “an extremely limited description and assessment”. While more than adequate coverage is included in the ECOS Plan regarding education, it is true that we don’t have very much information regarding school facilities and capacity. Therefore, we suggest the following addition to Section 2.3.1 Education, Knowledge and Skills:

**Overall School Enrollment Growth/Decline.** Although some schools are seeing an increase in enrollment (So. Burlington being an example), the majority of schools in Chittenden County are facing declining enrollment. From the 2002-2003 school year to the 2011-2012 school year Chittenden County schools experienced a decline in the ten year compounded annual growth rates (CAGR), 27% of Chittenden County schools experienced an increase in the ten year CAGR, and this figure was not available for 13% of the schools. NOTE: CAGR is used to measure enrollment growth or decline in Vermont. The formula looks at the first and last years’ enrollment values and compares them over the number of years in the specified time frame to determine a rate of change. The CAGR is different from a percent change which does not consider the number of years over which a change occurs. There were 22,229 students enrolled in Chittenden County in the 2011-2012 school year, a decrease of 4.9% from the 23,387 students enrolled in the 2003-2004 school year. See the Vermont Department of Education’s Public School Enrollment Report for the 2011-2012 School Year for more information.

Will add more on specific school facility improvement needs.

Libraries: identified as “an extremely limited description and assessment” and we agree with this assessment. Therefore, we suggest the following addition to Section 2.3.1 Education, Knowledge and Skills:

**Library facilities are well distributed across the region.** Only three municipalities in the region do not have a library: Bolton, Buel's Gore and St. George. All libraries in the region offer high speed internet access. Both South Burlington and Milton employ bookmobiles within their communities. See Vermont Department of Libraries, Vermont Public Library Statistics for more information. Current library expansion and improvements are needed in South Burlington, Essex Town, Colchester, Jericho as identified in the CEDS Project list (see the list in Section 4.2.6 for cost estimates, funding sources and proposed timelines for these projects).

Proposed Amendments to 2.5.5 Energy:

Energy Infrastructure: identified as “only mentioned in passing”, however it appears this topic is well covered in Section 2.5.5 Energy and Section 3.2.2 Concentrated Growth Strategy. Therefore, I recommend the following minor amendments to Section 2.5.5 (or make these additions to Section 3.2.2):

Chittenden County has a long history of electrical and natural gas energy efficiency programs, dating back to 1990, which have provided significant energy savings and economic benefits to the state and County. These programs along with improvements in federal standards have led to a reduction in per household and per employee energy consumption of electricity and natural gas. Reduction in energy consumption directly results in a reduction in energy bills. Current projects planned for increased
Energy efficiency include: Burlington's plan to recapture “waste heat” from the McNeil power plant and distribute it to the Old North End of Burlington and install heated greenhouses at the Intervale. See the CEDS Project list in Section 4.2.6 for cost estimates, funding sources and proposed timelines for these projects.

Vermont’s rural nature offers challenges for the transmission and distribution of energy. It is important to maintain and develop an energy production, transmission, and distribution infrastructure in Chittenden County that is efficient, reliable, cost-effective, and environmentally responsible. Current energy distribution projects include: Extension of 3-phase power in south Hinesburg along VT116 by Green Mountain Power; Extension of natural gas service in Hinesburg up Richmond Road by VT Gas; and Extension of natural gas service to St. George village center. See the CEDS Project list in Section 4.2.6 for cost estimates, funding sources and proposed timelines for these projects.

Proposed Amendments to 2.5.4 Infrastructure & Facilities:

Communications Infrastructure: identified as “only mentioned in passing”. The ECOS Plan already includes a section on broadband, but we suggest the following edits to clarify the assessment and needs:

Information technology is integral to fulfilling the economic needs of residents and businesses in the region. Telecommunications is the communication of information through various media. The ECOS Competitive Assessment Analysis Report identifies quality and costs of telecommunications services as the weakest utility infrastructure based on the Employer Survey. While broadband technology is widely available throughout Chittenden County: as of December 2011, approximately 99% of Chittenden County residents and 99.5% of non-residential structures (analysis included commercial, industrial, municipal structures) have access to Broadband, the defined broadband speeds are quite slow (768 kbps download/200 kbps upload speeds) and will need to improve. The federal definition of broadband is 768 kbps download/200 kbps upload speeds. It is a step in the right direction that the County already has a significant fiber optic capability (some currently dark) with many businesses already having T-1 capability. However, it will be imperative important to ensure that we are on par with other urban areas in the realm of number of service providers, service tiers, and affordability as the technology is constantly improving and we must keep up. Specifically, the defined broadband speeds are quite slow and will need to improve.

Solid Waste – identified as “only mentioned in passing” however, this is discussed in great detail in Section 2.5.4 Infrastructure & Facilities. There are also quite a number of CSWD facilities projects listed in the CEDS project list. Therefore, I recommend the following minor amendment to Section 2.5.4 Infrastructure & Facilities:

A sustainable society minimizes the amount and toxicity of the waste it generates, reuses materials, recycles, and composts. The Chittenden Solid Waste District (CSWD) is responsible for the management of solid waste in Chittenden County. The system in the County is a combination of public, private, and public/private programs. CSWD has established a range of programs and facilities to manage waste through reduction, diversion, and proper disposal. CSWD also has identified the need for and is in the process of developing a regional landfill site. (See the CEDS Project list in Section 4.2.6 for cost estimates, funding sources and proposed timeline for CSWD landfill design and construction projects). The tons of refuse disposed in Chittenden County have
been declining over the last 5 years, while the amount of recycled materials has increased. While those trends are positive, there is room for improvement. It is estimated that 27% of the municipal solid waste sent to the landfill is comprised of recyclable materials and 32% is comprised of organic materials that could be composted (Source: CSWD Estimate of the Components of Solid Waste Disposed for FY 2012). A State law passed in 2012 (Act 148) bans disposal of certain recyclables (effective July 1, 2015), yard debris and clean wood (effective July 1, 2016), and food scraps (phased in over time) from disposal. Residents and businesses in CSWD have been required to separate yard debris and recyclables from waste destined for disposal since 1993. The additional bans on food scraps and clean wood will have a significant impact on waste diversion in Chittenden County.

**Government/Administrative Facilities:** identified as “an extremely limited description and assessment”

Will provide recommended edits on this at a later date. We’ll have to figure out what exactly to add, while keeping this brief.

**Proposed Amendment to Section 2.2.2 Scenic, Recreational and Historic Resources:**

Recreation Facilities – identified as “only mentioned in passing”. However, these facilities are discussed in Section 2.2.2 Scenic, Recreational and Historic Resources, and Section 2.3.5 Arts, Culture & Recreation, including an indicator in each. The facilities themselves are listed on the ECOS online map as referenced in the Plan. There are also quite a number of recreation facilities listed in the CEDS project list. Therefore, I recommend the following minor amendment to Section 2.2.2 Scenic, Recreational and Historic Resources:

Chittenden County is rooted in its scenic, recreational, and historic resources. These provide residents a place to relax, play, gather, and learn about nature, conservation, and our heritage. They also provide important ecological functions including wildlife habitat, and water and air quality protection. These are supplemented by indoor and outdoor recreation facilities. An extensive system of shared-use paths, on-road bike lanes, and off-road trails connect the County’s recreational facilities and areas (this data can be found under the Natural Systems section of the online map located here: http://maps.ccrpcvt.org/ChittendenCountyVT/). In addition, municipalities are planning for new facilities and improvements to existing facilities to improve access and opportunities for recreation. See the CEDS Project list in Section 4.2.6 for cost estimates, funding sources and proposed timelines for fourteen recreation related projects throughout the County.

**Proposed Amendment to Section 2.3.2 Health:**

**Hospitals:** identified as “an extremely limited description and assessment”. While the ECOS Plan includes quite an extensive account of public health issues, it does not include information on health care related facilities and service centers. Therefore, I recommend the following addition to Section 2.5.4 Infrastructure & Facilities:

Chittenden County’s community hospital is the University of Vermont Medical Center – also Vermont’s only academic medical center, serving in this role for patients from across the state and the upper northeast corner of New York. The UVM Medical Center provides a full range of tertiary-level inpatient and outpatient services, provides primary care services at 10 Vermont locations, operates the region’s only Level I Trauma Center, and home to the University of Vermont Children’s Hospital. They are also a safety-net provider of critically important services to our region’s most vulnerable populations. As some
of the inpatient facilities are 50 to 70 years old, the Medical Center has a Master Facilities Plan to address the long-term health needs of our region – focusing on single rooms for inpatients and more space for providers and the equipment they need to provide high quality health care – while striving for LEED certification for healthy and efficient building design. Other direct care service facilities in Chittenden County include the Community Health Centers of Burlington (dedicated to providing exceptional care and with a commitment to serving people who have a limited ability to pay); Howard Center (a private non-profit organization committed to providing effective treatment for people with mental illness, developmental disabilities, emotional crises and substance abuse. Howard Center was founded in 1873 and serves more than 15,000 individuals and families every year); Visiting Nurse Association of Chittenden and Grand Isle Counties (home care and hospice providers); Bayada Home Health Care; and Nursing Homes (Wake Robin, Green Mountain Nursing Home, Burlington Health & Rehab, Kindred Transitional Care and Rehabilitation, Staff Farm Nursing Center, Pillsbury Manor, Ethen Allen Residence, others?).
Child Care Deficiency

Proposed Amendments to 2.3.1 Education:

Note – all language proposed is new.

Key issues/Trends/Insights

- Based on discussions with staff from Building Bright Futures this is our understanding of childcare issues. This draft has been shared with them for review and we will revise this section based on their input. The rate of families of children under 18 years and both parents in labor force has remained steady over the last seven years making childcare a necessity for working parents. Unfortunately, Childcare in Chittenden County and in Vermont is in short supply and is often unaffordable for working families. Searching for childcare if often difficult for parents especially for parents seeking childcare for infants as the number of infant slots are limited. Additionally, since 2012, the percent of kids under the age of 5 have increased while the number of regulated child care programs has been decreasing. Insert data on weekly childcare costs. Although the demand for childcare is great, especially in areas served by transit and where jobs are located, one would think that this need would drive the supply of quality childcare programs to increase. However, it is difficult to make a child care business successful and profitable. Childcare centers are in the top tier of businesses that are the riskiness for banks to lend money to. A center needs to enroll at least 60 kids for the business to be profitable. A center that can handle 60+ kids requires an adequate space to meet state licensing requirements. Finding affordable space in a community is challenging as our real estate market is already in short supply and there are also additional costs to fitting up a space so that is suitable to meet the early educations needs of kids ages 0-5. Another option in the State to deliver childcare is the ability to provide day care in home based program. However, there are limits to the number of kids a registered home can care for and state licensing requirements are requiring more credentials making it increasingly harder for home providers to be competitive with childcare centers.

- Quality child-care services provide important benefits to a community and the region by contributing to early childhood development, preparing children for schooling, and enabling parents of young children to participate in the workforce. Early education programs for children ages (0-5) not only enhance children’s social skills, resulting in greater personal and community civility and a reduction in crime rate but also have a positive impact on the economy. Childcare reduces employers’ recruiting and training costs for new employees resulting from turnovers due to parents’ inability to obtain adequate child-care services, enhances the productivity of working parents, and expands local and regional economies. When child-care providers hire local workers and buy goods and services from local businesses, economic development is enhanced through the “multiplier effect” (see the circle of prosperity on page XX).

- Key Indicators

# of regulated care and education programs (registered and licensed) in Chittenden County
percent of regulated care and education programs (registered and licensed) of high quality (4 & 5 Stars level) in Chittenden County.
## CAPACITY OF CHILD-CARE PROGRAMS IN CHITTENDEN COUNTY, 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Program</th>
<th>Age Group Served</th>
<th>0-5 Years Old</th>
<th>3-5 Years Old</th>
<th>6-12 Years Old</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total Slots</td>
<td>Occupied Slots</td>
<td>Vacancy Rate</td>
<td>Total Slots</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Day</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center Based</td>
<td>3,877</td>
<td>3,683</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Based</td>
<td>961</td>
<td>814</td>
<td>15.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part Day</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center Based</td>
<td></td>
<td>529</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Based</td>
<td></td>
<td>75</td>
<td>16.0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Age Only (Part Day)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center / School Based</td>
<td></td>
<td>2,079</td>
<td>1,909</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Based</td>
<td></td>
<td>472</td>
<td>447</td>
<td>5.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>4,838</td>
<td>4,497</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
<td>604</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A slot may be filled by more than one child. Vacancy Rate is the percentage of Unoccupied Slots / Total Slots.
SOURCE: Child Care Resource Center.

**ESTIMATED NEED AND SUPPLY OF CHILD-CARE SERVICES IN CHITTENDEN COUNTY, 2014**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group Served</th>
<th>2014 Estimated Need*</th>
<th>2014 Supply (Total Slots)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt; 5 Years Old</td>
<td>8,668</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Proposed Amendments to ECOS Strategy 3.2.6 Equip our residents with the education and skills that they need to thrive.**

8. Ensure that children ages (0-5) have adequate access to high quality and affordable early learning and education programs by integrating child care issues into the planning process, including child care financing, infrastructure, business assistance for child care providers, and child care workforce development.

1. Encourage municipalities to negotiate with developers and to offer incentives to provide space for childcare in all types of projects, residential, office, mixed use, and commercial, including new construction and reuse.

2. Work with municipalities periodically should review land-use and development regulations to identify needed amendments to authorize quality child-care services in appropriate locations convenient to households, including at home occupations.

3. Employers, schools, and community organizations should collaborate to ensure that affordable, quality child-care services are available to meet the different needs of households, especially low and medium income families, working parents, and those with limited transportation.

4. Work with regional partners to ensure that training and education for childcare professionals are available and well-funded, and that childcare workers earn a living wage.

5. Connect the business community with the recommendations of the Vermont’s Blue Ribbon Commission on Financing High Quality, Affordable Child Care (currently under development) Click [here](#) to access a short video on this initiative.
### Regional Plan Update by:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Deficiencies in Statutory Requirements</th>
<th>Issues Identified in Report</th>
<th>RPC Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>June 30, 2016</td>
<td><em>D in the utilities and facilities element - §4348a(a)(5) Page 3</em></td>
<td><em>Other than a map, the plan includes an extremely limited description and assessment of the region’s utilities and facilities. School facilities, libraries, hospitals and government / administrative facilities are not mentioned at all. Recreation facilities, energy infrastructure, communications infrastructure, and solid waste facilities are only mentioned in passing.</em></td>
<td><em>While wastewater treatment, water supply and stormwater facilities are adequately discussed in the Plan, the analysis on some of the other utilities may not be discussed as adequately. Needed improvements on most of the utilities are listed on the CEDS list. However, those needs are not clearly described in Chapters 2 and 3 of the ECOS Plan. Those connections can be improved. Because we will be required to incorporate a Flood Resiliency section into the Plan after July 1, 2014, Staff recommends that we address these issues at the same time. The All Hazard Mitigation Plans are closely tied to the Flood Resiliency component and will need to be updated in 2016 (starting in 2015). Therefore, CCRPC recommends that we amend this element of the Plan by June, 2016.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 30, 2016</td>
<td><em>F in assessing impacts of growth relative to adjacent regions - §4348a(a)(8) Page 4</em></td>
<td><em>Provision of utilities and facilities is essential to implementing the plan’s land use strategy. The plan would be strengthened by assessing the needs and recommending projects, similar to the transportation plan.</em></td>
<td><em>Same as above.</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The plan does not assess the impacts that growth and development in adjacent regions may have on Chittenden County. It simply makes the statement that the plan is compatible with the plans of adjoining regions with

This analysis was done, but not described in the Plan. This analysis can be updated and added to the Plan. Because we will be required to incorporate a Flood Resiliency section into the Plan after July 1, 2014, Staff recommends that we address these issues at the same time. The All Hazard Mitigation Plans are closely tied to the Flood Resiliency component and will need to be updated in 2016 (starting in 2015). Therefore, CCRPC recommends that we amend this element of the Plan by June, 2016.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date (Optional)</th>
<th>Deficiencies in Non-Statutory Requirements</th>
<th>Issues Identified in Report</th>
<th>RPC Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>June 30, 2016</td>
<td>no demonstration of how that determination was made.</td>
<td>The plan does not assess the impacts that growth and development in Chittenden County may have on adjacent regions. It simply makes the statement that the plan is compatible with the plans of adjoining regions with no demonstration of how that determination was made.</td>
<td>Same as above.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 30, 2018</td>
<td><strong>D in earth extraction goal</strong> - §4302(c)(10) Page 7</td>
<td>The plan does not include specific policies or recommended projects related to the appropriate extraction of earth resources.</td>
<td>This is a fair assessment and largely a result of a lack of relevancy and resources to fully assess the issue in Chittenden County. Throughout the comprehensive and extensive discussions that took place in establishing the ECOS Plan, extraction resource issues did not rise to a significant level. Due to a lack of resources to research and examine this topic CCRPC recommends that this is addressed when the entire ECOS Plan is updated in 2018.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 30, 2018</td>
<td><strong>D in child care goal</strong> - §4302(c)(13) Page 8</td>
<td>The plan makes two statements related to child care, but both are broad aspirations not specific policies or recommended projects.</td>
<td>This is a fair assessment and largely a result of a lack of relevancy and resources to fully assess the issue in Chittenden County. Throughout the comprehensive and extensive discussions that took place in establishing the ECOS Plan, this did not rise to a significant level. Due to a lack of resources to research and examine this topic CCRPC recommends that this is addressed when the entire ECOS Plan is updated in 2018.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Date by which you propose to adopt a regional plan that addresses the statutory deficiency
in Act 250 and Section 248 proceedings is described in the *Guidelines and Standards for Reviewing Act 250 and Section 248 Applications*. This policy document establishes a cooperative relationship of the CCRPC Board with its member municipalities and development community to appropriately address issues of regional concern. An amendment to the Regional Plan that would take a different approach to these proceedings is not needed at this time.