

Malletts Bay Transportation Scoping Study Project

Evaluation Matrix: West Lakeshore Drive Bicycle & Pedestrian Improvements

		Alt. 1 No Build	Alt. 2 Shared Use Lanes	Alt. 3 Bike Lanes (both sides of road)	Alt. 4 Shared Use Path (south side of road)	Alt. 4A Alt. 4 + Section at Water Elevation	Alt. 4B Alt. 4 + Overlook Area	Alt. 4C Alt. 4 + North side path at western end
Costs	Engineering Design ⁺	\$0	\$10,000	\$80,000	\$230,000	\$510,000	\$400,000	\$510,000
	Roadway/Path Construction	\$0	\$20,000	\$510,000	\$1,300,000	\$1,550,000	\$1,420,000	\$1,600,000
	Stormwater Improvements (Meets Standards)	\$0	\$0	\$1,000,000	\$1,000,000	\$1,000,000	\$1,000,000	\$1,000,000
	Stormwater Improvements (Exceeds Standards)	\$0	\$0	\$2,600,000	\$2,600,000	\$2,600,000	\$2,600,000	\$2,600,000
	Retaining Wall, Railing & Stairs Construction	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$50,000	\$1,780,000	\$0
	Resident (Construction) Engineering	\$0	\$0	\$40,000	\$130,000	\$160,000	\$130,000	\$160,000
	Water line Relocation Cost	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,500,000	\$2,500,000	\$2,500,000	\$2,500,000
	Total (Meets Standards, Not including ROW)	\$0	\$30,000	\$1,630,000	\$5,160,000	\$5,770,000	\$7,230,000	\$5,770,000
	Total (Exceeds Standards, Not including ROW)	\$0	\$30,000	\$3,230,000	\$6,760,000	\$7,370,000	\$8,830,000	\$7,370,000
Engineering	Typical Section	11' travel lanes 1-3' paved shoulder 5' sidewalk	11' travel lanes 1-3' paved shoulder 5' sidewalk	11' travel lanes 5' bike lanes	11' travel lanes 1-3' paved shoulders 10' paved shared use path	11' travel lanes 1-3' paved shoulders 10' paved shared use path	11' travel lanes 1-3' paved shoulders 10' paved shared use path	11' travel lanes 1-3' paved shoulders 10' paved shared use path
	Bicycle Access	-	Shared use lanes	5' bike lanes	Adds shared use path	Adds shared use path	Adds shared use path	Adds shared use path
	Overall Safety	-	Slight improvement for cyclists (Heightened driver awareness)	Improved for cyclists (Striped lane for bicyclists)	Improved for Path Users (Bicyclists and pedestrians are given more room and separated from vehicles)	Improved for Path Users (Bicyclists and pedestrians are given more room and separated from vehicles)	Improved for Path Users (Bicyclists and pedestrians are given more room and separated from vehicles)	Improved for Path Users (Bicyclists and pedestrians are given more room and separated from vehicles)
	ROW Impacts	-	No	No	Moderate	High	Moderate	Moderate
Impacts	Agricultural Lands	-	No	Potential	Potential	Potential	Potential	Potential
	Archaeological	-	No	No	No	No	No	No
	Historic	-	No	No	No	No	No	No
	Hazardous Materials	-	No	No	No	No	No	No
	Floodplains	-	No	No	No	Yes	Potential	No
	Shoreland	-	No	No	No	Yes	Potential	No
	Fish & Wildlife	-	No	No	No	No	No	No
	Rare, Threatened & Endangered Species	-	No	No	No	Potential	Potential	No
	Public Lands - Sect. 4(f)	-	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	LWCP - Sect. 6(f)	-	No	No	No	No	No	No
	Managed Lands	-	No	No	No	No	No	No
	Noise	-	No	No	No	No	No	No
	Wetlands	-	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
New Impervious Surfaces	-	No	Yes - 13% New	Yes - 17% New	Yes - 21% New	Yes - 24% New	Yes 24% New	
Stormwater Accommodations	None	Moderate (Narrow green belt for bioswales)	Low (Narrowed greenbelt does not accommodate bioswales)	Moderate (Narrow green belt for bioswales)	Moderate (Narrow green belt for bioswales)	Moderate (Narrow green belt for bioswales)	Moderate (Narrow green belt for bioswales)	
Local & Regional	Aesthetics	-	No impacts	Minimal	Improved	Improved w/ water views	Improved w/ Water Views	Improved
	Community Character	-	No impacts	Minimal	Improved	Improved	Improved	Improved
	Economic Impacts	-	No impacts	Minimal	Positive	Positive	Positive	Positive
	Conformance to Reg. Transp. Plan	-	Potential	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Compliance With Current Zoning	-	Yes	Yes	Yes	No*	No*	Yes
	Satisfies Purpose & Need	No	No	Partial	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Permits	Act 250	-	No	No	Potential	Potential	Potential
Section 404 - Wetlands (USACOE)		-	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Section 401 Water Quality Certification		-	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
State Wetlands Permit		-	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Stream Alteration Permit		-	No	No	No	No	No	No
Construction Phase Storm Water Discharge Permit (General Permit 3-9020)		-	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Operational Phase Storm Water Discharge Permit (General Permit 3-9015)		-	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Lakes & Ponds		-	No	No	No	Potential	Potential	No
Rare, Threatened, and Endangered Species		-	No	No	No	No	No	No
Section 1111 Permit	-	No	No	No	No	No	No	

+ - Engineering Design costs include those costs associated with engineering and design for bike/ped, water line and stormwater (Meets Standards) improvements

* - Not compliant with current zoning as written. May be approved after Town review