



c/o Chittenden County RPC
110 West Canal Street, Suite 202
Winooski, VT 05404
www.ccrpcvt.org/northern-lake-champlain-cwsp/
802-861-0133

Date: February 17, 2023

To: Basin 5 Water Quality Council
CC: DEC staff and subgrant applicants

Re: Staff recommendation: applications for Water Quality Formula Subgrant, round 1

Attached is a 3-page PDF showing the relative scores for each of the four applications we received based upon a scale of 70 points for phosphorus reduction cost effectiveness, 20 points for co-benefits and 10 points for other considerations. Note that pursuant to Act 76 Rule and Guidance, the Council may adjust the co-benefit scores if it disagrees with my scoring.

The goal of CCRPC as the Basin 5 CWSP is to meet our annual target of 41.9 kg per year with an available projects budget of approximately \$548,539. That means that a key metric for us is that projects on average should achieve a Cost Effectiveness in \$/kg/year of approximately \$13,092. We have some leeway from DEC given that we and other CWSPs are just getting started, and overall CWSP performance term ends 6/30/26 but it is a metric we must always bear in mind.

My recommendation regarding these applications is as follows:

- **Georgia: Mill River Rd., NW:** Due to the very low Annual Average reduction of 1.46 kg/year, sub-optimal design life as well as questions about interaction with the town's MRGP requirements, ask the FNLC to update the application with a more detailed scope of work based upon a scope of work and cost secured via competitive RFP and resubmit it for our next round of applications.
- **Georgia: Mill River Rd. SE:** Due to relatively lower kg/year reduction and sub-optimal design life, FNLC should be selected to receive a subgrant with the proviso that FNLC check-in after 60% design is complete and the numbers for kg/year and design life are updated, then report back to CWSP and Council who will then authorize completion of grant scope or halt expenditure for the time being.
- **Georgia: Falls Trail Gully Repair:** Due to the excellent potential kg/year reduction, the Town of Georgia should be selected to receive the subgrant as proposed.
- **Shelburne: McCabe's Brook:** Due to the potential kg/year reduction being very close to the Basin 5 required average of \$13,092, Lewis Creek Association should be selected to receive the subgrant as proposed.

Note that subgrantees will be required to adhere to all provisions of the Master Agreement as posted at <https://www.ccrpcvt.org/northern-lake-champlain-cwsp/#funding> as well as all the other requirements in the Call for Applications especially the [CWIP Funding Policy](#)

You will note that the agenda includes "Appointment of three Member to advise CWSP on scoring methodology." Given that this my first attempt at developing a scoring system using the recommended 70-2-10 split and we are all learning by doing, it would be helpful to me to have 2-3 council members advise me on further refinements to the methodology.

I look forward to our meeting on February 23rd at 10 a.m.

			1. Cost effectiveness relative to Basin 5 target & available funds					2. Co-benefits	3. Other Considerations		
PROJECT	ROUND 1 Request	\$ needed for 1) further design & 2) Construction	Total cost	Annual Avg (kg/yr)	\$/kg	Design Life	\$/kg./yr.	70 POINTS	20 POINTS	10 POINTS	TOTAL
			Total cost	Annual Avg (kg/yr)	\$/kg	15	* if life > 15				
Georgia: Mill River Rd, NW, Regrading & Plunge Pool	\$15,262	\$7,000	\$22,262	1.46	\$15,248	10	\$22,872	10	3	2	15
Georgia: Mill River Rd, SE, Gully Restoration & Chamber	\$15,262	\$40,000	\$55,262	4.64	\$11,910	10	\$17,865	30	3	2	35
Georgia: Falls Trail Gully Repair	\$23,465	\$30,000	\$53,465	20.74	\$2,578	15	\$2,578	70	1	6	77
Shelburne: McCabe's Brook Process-based restoration	\$23,295	\$40,000	\$63,295	7.01	\$9,029	10	\$13,544	40	4	0	44

Total/Average \$77,284 \$117,000 \$194,284 33.85 \$5,740

ANNUAL TARGET Kilograms 41.9 ANNUAL FUNDING AVAILABLE: >>>> \$548,539

B5: Standard Cost per Kg. relative to available funds >>>> \$13,092

COST EFFECTIVENESS FORMULA (\$/kg/yr) = (15 years/design life years of your project) * (total capital project cost (dollars) for design and construction) / (annual average total phosphorus source load reduction (kg/yr)).

Scoring Scale

< \$7,000	70
< \$10,000	60
< \$13,000	50
< \$16,000	40
< \$19,000	30
< \$22,000	20
< \$25,000	10
> \$25,000	0

Calculations by CWSP staff

	Range	Weight, 1 or 2	Max Score	Mill River, NW	Mill River, SE	Falls Trail	McCabe's Brook	Notes
Flood Resilience	1-4	2	8	2	2	0	0	Would likely only get points if in stream/river.
Hazard Mitigation	1-4	2	8	4	4	0	2	reduces threats to infrastructure
Education	1-4	2	8	0	0	0	2	Most projects talked about potential for education but did not commit formally to it nor, for example, by showing they had match funds obtained for an education panel on site.
Ecosystem Improvement	1-4	2	8	2	2	2	2	A given for all projects.
Local Pollution Prevention	1-4	2	8	2	2	0	2	Three projects that scored all mentioned nitrogen.
Habitat Improvement	1-4	2	8	0	0	0	6	Only one project truly restores habitat.
Environmental Justice	1-4	2	8	0	0	0	0	No discrete benefits to disadvantaged communities.
Aids Muni or non-profit with permit	1-3	1	3	0	0	0	0	Rare, would only happen if part of a joint permit/non-regulatory project.
Community Support	1-3	1	3	1	1	1	1	Letters from town or community entities.
Other Enviro	1-3	1	3	0	0	0	0	We should probably get rid of this metric.
Services to Public	1-3	1	3	0	0	1	0	Falls Trail gets this due to recreation improvement.
		MAX	68	11	11	4	15	
	Conversion to 20 >>>>		20	3	3	1	4	
				Mill River, NW	Mill River, SE	Falls Trail	McCabe's Brook	

							Mill River, NW	Mill River, SE	Falls Trail	McCabe's Brook
	Positive Scores									
	Construction proposal >>>				8		0	0	0	0
	Final Design proposal >>>				4		4	4	4	0
	Conceptual Design proposal				0		0	0	0	0
	Design life 16-20 years				2		0	0	0	0
	Design life 21+				4		0	0	0	0
	Provides match up to 10% of overall budget				2		2	2	2	0
	Provides match over 10% of overall budget				4		0	0	0	0
	Provides match over 20% of overall budget				6		0	0	0	0
	Provides match over 30% of overall budget				8		0	0	0	0
	Negative scores									
	Minor uncertainties in budget				-2		-2	-2	0	0
	Major uncertainties in budget				-4		0	0	0	0
	Minor but passable potential barriers				-4		-2	-2	0	0
	Major potential barriers to implementation				-8		0	0	0	0
	Key Landowner letter/email is missing				-4		0	0	0	0
	Landowner commitment letter weak				-2		0	0	0	0
	O & M costs exceed \$2,000 per year				-4		0	0	0	0
	Project not in conformance with Basin 5 Plan				-10		0	0	0	0
	Applicant has little applicable experience				-4		0	0	0	0
						TOTA	2	2	6	0
							Mill River, NW	Mill River, SE	Falls Trail	McCabe's Brook