



c/o Chittenden County RPC  
110 West Canal Street, Suite 202  
Winooski, VT 05404  
[www.ccrpcvt.org/northern-lake-champlain-cwsp/](http://www.ccrpcvt.org/northern-lake-champlain-cwsp/)  
802-861-0133

**Date: November 14, 2023**

**To: Basin 5 Water Quality Council**  
**CC: DEC staff and subgrant applicants**

**Re: Staff recommendation: applications for Water Quality Formula Subgrant, round 4**

Attached is a PDF showing the relative scores for each of the four applications we received for the February 2023 round compared to the single proposal from UVM that we received for the current 4<sup>th</sup> round which ended on November 3<sup>rd</sup>. The scores are based upon a scale of 70 points for phosphorus reduction cost effectiveness, 20 points for co-benefits and 10 points for other considerations. Note that pursuant to Act 76 Rule and Guidance, the Council may adjust the co-benefit scores if it disagrees with my scoring.

The goal of CCRPC as the Basin 5 CWSP is to meet our annual target of 41.9 kg per year with an available projects budget of approximately \$548,539. That means that a key metric for us is that projects on average should achieve a Cost Effectiveness in \$/kg/year of approximately \$13,092. We have some leeway from DEC given that we and other CWSPs are just getting started, and overall CWSP performance term ends 6/30/26 but it is a metric we must always bear in mind. Note: We may wish to lower this touchstone number of \$13,092 in the future given that we are currently providing two project identification grants (to CCRPC and to NRPC) with funds coming out of the \$548k available for projects.)

My recommendation and particular metrics regarding the current application, **UVM Horticultural Farm Dam Removal and Floodplain Restoration**, is as follows:

- The project is ready to construct in the summer of 2024 with a contractor already procured.
- Overall cost is \$609,500 which can be fully covered by UVM.
- Of that cost, approximately \$84,600 is attributable to the floodplain restoration and culvert replacement elements which will reduce phosphorus by 3.6 kg per year over a 50-year lifespan.
- Floodplain reconnection - 0.74 acres of restoration @ 10lb/acre/year (4.6kg/ac/yr) = 3.4 kg/year
- Replace undersized culvert (existing 30% of bank full width) = 0.2 kg/yr
- If we covered the full \$84,600, we would be “buying” phosphorus reduction at a cost of \$23,500 per kilogram which is relatively inefficient.
- The project has high scores in terms of Co-Benefits and Other Considerations.
- **Staff recommends that we provide \$15,000 per kilogram of the 3.6 kilograms of phosphorus reduced by the project for a total of \$54,000 (fifty-four thousand dollars).** While this is higher than our preferred metric of about \$13,000 per kilogram, a contribution in this range is consistent with our prior awards and this project fits well into our “portfolio” of projects.

Note that subgrantees will be required to adhere to all provisions of the Master Agreement as posted at <https://www.ccrpcvt.org/northern-lake-champlain-cwsp/#funding> as well as all the other requirements in the Call for Applications especially the [CWIP Funding Policy](#).

I have also attached more details on the Cost Breakdown as well as two documents showing the P-reduction calculations.

See you on Thursday at 10 a.m. <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/81477594157>

**Co-Benefit Scores**

**Scoring Template for Co-Benefits, as finalized, 8-17-2023**

**Calculations by CWSP staff**

<b>Benefit</b>	<b>Range</b>	<b>Weight, 1 or 2</b>	<b>Max Score</b>	<b>UVM Hort Farm, Construction</b>	<b>Mill River, NW</b>	<b>Mill River, SE</b>	<b>Falls Trail</b>	<b>McCabe's Brook</b>
Hazard Mitigation	1-4	2	8	4				
Education	1-4	2	8	4				
Ecosystem Improvement	1-4	2	8	4				
Habitat Improvement	1-4	2	8	4				
Environmental Justice	1-4	2	8	0				
Community Support	1-3	2	6	6				
Other Benefits	1-4	1	4	1				
		<b>MAX</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>23</b>				
	Conversion to 20 point scale	>>>>	20	<b>9</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>4</b>
				<b>UVM Hort Farm</b>				

*\* Note: Co-Benefit matrix changed between version used in February 2023 and version finalized in August 2023*

## Scoring Template for Other Considerations

Proposed phase of project funding, certainty of costs in proposal, potential complications, demonstrated ability/experience of applicant to complete project, relative commitment of landowner to project phases, project operations & maintenance costs, design life beyond 15 years, conformance with Basin 5 Plan

					Possible points	UVM Hort Farm	Mill River, NW	Mill River, SE	Falls Trail	McCabe's Brook	
<b>Positive Scores</b>											
Construction proposal >>>					8	8					
Final Design proposal >>>					4		4	4	4		
Conceptual Design proposal					0						
Design life 16-20 years					2						
Design life 21+					4	4					
Provides match up to 10% of overall budget					2		2	2	2		
Provides match over 10% of overall budget					4	4					
Provides match over 20% of overall budget					6						
Provides match over 30% of overall budget					8						
<b>Negative scores</b>											
Minor uncertainties in budget					-2		-2	-2			
Major uncertainties in budget					-4						
Minor but passable potential barriers					-4		-2	-2			
Major potential barriers to implementation					-8						
Key Landowner letter/email is missing					-4						
Landowner commitment letter weak					-2						
O & M costs exceed \$2,000 per year					-4						
Project not in conformance with Basin 5 Plan					-10						
Applicant has little applicable experience					-4						
						<b>TOTA</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>
						<b>MAX IS 10</b>					

**Brothers Corporation****UVM Horticultural Farm Dam Decommissioning & Floodplain Restoration**

October 30, 2023

ATTN: Adam Frazier

Adam,

As per your request I have broken down several of our bid items to separate the excavation portion of the work from the floodplain restoration elements. Please see below:

Floodplain/Wetland	\$117,000.00
--------------------	--------------

a) Excavation	\$ 97,200.00
---------------	--------------

b) Floodplain Elements	\$ 19,800.00
------------------------	--------------

Site Restoration/Plantings	\$ 64,800.00
----------------------------	--------------

a) Excavation	\$ 43,800.00
---------------	--------------

b) Floodplain Elements	\$ 21,000.00
------------------------	--------------

Please let me know if you need any further information.

Randy Laframboise



**Estimated Phosphorus Credit for Stream Stability and Storage**

**SubUnit(s) IDs:** 41\_M05B\_PLG\_C00, 41\_M05B

**Town:** SOUTH BURLINGTON

**Projects Included:** Restore Channel Slope, Plant Floodplain, Restore Wetland, Plant 50-Foot Riparian Area, Lower Floodplain, Restore Channel Roughness and Wood, Remove Medium Run of River Dam

**Stream Names:** -

**Project Area (acres):** 0.74

Stream Stability and Storage Credit Summary

	Year 1 Credit (kg)	Year 2+ Credit (kg/yr)	Estimated 15 Yr Lifespan Credit (kg)
<b>Floodplain Connectivity (Lateral - Vertical)</b>			
Stream Stability	0.0	0.0	0.0
Storage	6.7	3.4	53.7
<b>Stream Connectivity (Longitudinal - Temporal)</b>			
Stream Stability	0.0	0.0	0.0
TOTAL	6.7	3.4	53.7

